SKVC

STUDIJŲ KOKYBĖS VERTINIMO CENTRAS

Utenos kolegijos

STUDIJŲ PROGRAMOS *"TEISĖ"*
(valstybinis kodas 6531KX007)
VERTINIMO IŠVADOS

_____

EVALUATION REPORT
OF *''LAW''* (state code 6531KX007)
STUDY PROGRAMME
at Utena College

Review' team:

1. **Prof. dr. Janez Kranjc (team leader)** *academic,*

2. **Prof. dr. Vera de Hesselle,** *academic,*

3. **Prof. dr. Tanel Kerikmäe,** *academic,*

4. **Ms. Jolita Mikalkevičiūtė,** *representative of social partners'*

5. **Ms. Žiedūnė Sabaitytė,** *students' representative.*

Evaluation coordinator -

Ms. Natalja Bogdanova

Išvados parengtos anglų kalba

Report language – English

Vilnius
2017

DUOMENYS APIE ĮVERTINTĄ PROGRAMĄ

Studijų programos pavadinimas	*Teisė*
Valstybinis kodas	6531KX007
Studijų krypčių grupė	Teisė
Studijų kryptis	Teisė
Studijų programos rūšis	koleginės
Studijų pakopa	pirmoji
Studijų forma (trukmė metais)	Nuolatinė – 3 metai, ištęstinė – 4 metai
Studijų programos apimtis kreditais	180
Suteikiamas laipsnis ir (ar) profesinė kvalifikacija	Teisės profesinis bakalauras
Studijų programos įregistravimo data	2011-06-17

_____

INFORMATION ON EVALUATED STUDY PROGRAMME

Title of the study programme	*Law*
State code	6531KX007
Group of study field	Law
Study field	Law
Type of the study programme	College studies
Study cycle	First
Study mode (length in years)	Full-time – 3 years, Part-time – 4 years
Volume of the study programme in credits	180
Degree and (or) professional qualifications awarded	Professional Bachelor in Law
Date of registration of the study programme	17-06-2011

CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of the evaluation process

The evaluation of on-going study programmes is based on the **Methodology for evaluation of Higher Education study programmes,** approved by Order No 1-01-162 of 20 December 2010 of the Director of the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education (hereafter – SKVC).

The evaluation is intended to help higher education institutions to constantly improve their study programmes and to inform the public about the quality of studies.

The evaluation process consists of the main following stages: *1) self-evaluation and self-evaluation report prepared by Higher Education Institution (hereafter – HEI); 2) visit of the review team at the higher education institution; 3) production of the evaluation report by the review team and its publication; 4) follow-up activities.*

On the basis of external evaluation report of the study programme SKVC takes a decision to accredit study programme either for 6 years or for 3 years. If the programme evaluation is negative such a programme is not accredited.

The programme is **accredited for 6 years** if all evaluation areas are evaluated as "very good" (4 points) or "good" (3 points).

The programme is **accredited for 3 years** if none of the areas was evaluated as "unsatisfactory" (1 point) and at least one evaluation area was evaluated as "satisfactory" (2 points).

The programme **is not accredited** if at least one of evaluation areas was evaluated as "unsatisfactory" (1 point).

1.2. General

The Application documentation submitted by the HEI follows the outline recommended by the SKVC. Along with the self-evaluation report and annexes, the following additional documents have been provided by the HEI before the site-visit:

No.	Name of the document
1	Criteria for the evaluation of the final exam and criteria for the publishing of study results
2	Report of the Chairman of the Qualification Commission; 2017-06-12
3	Minutes of the meeting of the study program committee; 2016-03-09
4	Minutes of the meeting of the study program committee; 2016-03-23
5	Minutes of the meeting of the Department of Law; 2016-03-30
6	Minutes of the meeting of the Department of Law; 2015-10-16

1.3. Background of the HEI/Faculty/Study field/ Additional information

Utena University of Applied Sciences is a state higher education institution established in 2000. It is the only higher educational institution in the region and teaches 21 study programmes (including law) for ca 1800 students. Utena UAS offers the first cycle college level degree-granting studies and award Professional Bachelor's degrees in the fields of social, technology and biomedicine sciences. There are two main organisational subdivisions at Utena UAS: the Faculty of Business and Technology and the Faculty of Medicine; there are 9 departments within the faculties which perform the academic and scientific activity by executing applied scientific research. The study programme of Law is implemented in the Department of Law of the Faculty of Business and Technology. In 2013 the Law Study Programme Committee was established which is in charge of continuing management of the Law SP.

The previous evaluation of the programme under evaluation was carried out in 2014; the programme was given 3 years accreditation.

1.4. The Review Team

The review team was completed according *Description of experts' recruitment*, approved by order No. V-41 of Acting Director of the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education. The Review Visit to HEI was conducted by the team on *24ᵗʰ October 2017*.

1. **Prof. dr. Janez Kranjc (team leader),** *Professor of the Dep. of Law at the University of Ljubljana, Slovenia.*
2. **Prof. dr. Vera de Hesselle,** *Professor of Bremen University of Applied Sciences, Germany.*
3. **Prof. dr. Tanel Kerikmäe,** *Professor of Tallinn University of Technology, Estonia.*
4. **Ms. Jolita Mikalkevičiūtė,** *lawyer, Lithuania.*
5. **Ms. Žiedūnė Sabaitytė,** *Master student of Vilnius Gediminas Technical University, Lithuania.*

II. PROGRAMME ANALYSIS

2.1. Programme aims and learning outcomes

The programme aims are to train highly qualified lawyers being able to work independently in legal professions and to perform highly responsible roles such as working as a pre-trial investigation officer, customs official, manager or specialist in human resources, assistant to the bailiff, official in municipal administrative bodies, in judicial institutions, in the social insurance sector or as a lawyer in the private sector (see SER p. 6). The Review Team noticed the aims matching the mission of education and research at the level of Higher Education (see e.g. the detailed course descriptions in Annex 2 of SER). The aim of the programme fulfils

the requirements of the education and research policies. The graduates will become proficient in critical thinking and knowledgeable in the methods of applying legislative acts. The Review Team also noticed a high degree of identification of professors and other teachers with the programme. The students were well informed about the aims and the learning outcomes of the programme. The social partners expressed their satisfaction with the knowledge and skills of students and graduates of the College.

The aims and learning outcomes of the programme are posted on the website of Utena UAS and also on the website of LAMA BPO, the Lithuanian Higher Institutions Association for Organizing Joint Admission, and the database AIKOS. The provided information is clear, but it was found that details are not easy to find. Therefore the Review Team judge that more easily accessible details should be provided, although interested persons can in fact access the necessary information.

Further information is offered on request during events such visits at high schools, and similar institutions, at events organised by the Department of Law (e.g., a quiz contest "In corpore: Human Rights"), at "school talks", at "Open days" at Utena UAS as well as through participation at educational and business fairs. The information is continuously disseminated and updated by the management, e.g. at regional congresses and through the website of the College.

The students are informed about the learning outcomes and the types of examination through the website and this information is furthermore given in the first lecture. It would be good if this kind of information would also be given in more detail through the website.

The College collects and analyses data on the employment and carriers of its graduates and uses these data to evaluate the demands of the labour market for professionals (see p. 7 SER). Opinions of employers and social partners (via email or informally in discussions) are used to determine the skills needed by lawyers, to define and to adjust the learning outcomes, and the curriculum content as well as the study methods on a regular basis. Interviewed stakeholders and employers expressed the feeling of being integrated in the process of amendments and in the programme management. Some of the social partners and stakeholders were alumni of the programme.

There are two specialisations offered by the College, Pre-trial investigation (private sector) and Legal service (public sector) needed in the local and regional labour market.

The general and specific learning outcomes allow students to gain legal knowledge and legal skills such as how to analyse problems, how to read and understand legal texts (SER p. 6). The learning outcomes are clearly formulated, well-defined, transparent, and accessible (see the course description Annex 2 of SER).

The name of the programme, the learning outcomes of each subject with regard to the specialization, content and the knowledge offered comply with each other (see p. 7 SER; p. 8, table 2 SER; table 4 p. 12 SER). The Review Team appreciated the analysis of learning outcomes in course description (e.g. the course descriptions in Annex 2 of SER, chapter: study outcomes and methods of assessment).

The Review Team noticed that the learning outcomes were based on the academic and professional requirements and seem to meet the needs of both private and public sector. The programme clearly complies with the Descriptor of Study Cycles in table 3 of SER (p. 10 SER). The programme's aims and learning outcomes relate to the type and level of studies and to the level of qualifications offered.

The recommendations of the previous evaluation were taken into account. The employment of the graduates of the programme has been evaluated. To this extent, the requirements are met. The Review Team members note a clear satisfaction of students and of stakeholders with the performance of the College.

Conclusion: The programme aims, objectives and intended fields of learning outcomes meet the legal requirements. The programme is developed systematically. The information about the programme should be provided in a more comprehensive and efficient way.

2.2. Curriculum design

The programme is designed in accordance with the ECTS system and is in line with the legislative requirements. Every semester has 20 weeks. The programme is divided into a full-time and a part-time version. The Review Team noticed that the lectures are given separately – for full-time students during the week, and in four blocks during the academic year for part-time students.

Subjects and topics are not repeated (see Annex 2 SER).

The study volume meets the accreditation requirements.

The subject descriptions are written in a detailed manner. The teaching methods cover the transfer of knowledge, methods of comprehension, of application, analysis, synthesis and evaluation. Insofar, these requirements are met. The Review Team was satisfied with the content of the subjects and methods that ensure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

According to the Lithuanian practice, a module has to amount to 10 ECTS. The differentiation between modules and subjects was not made transparent in the SER and the module /subjects descriptions. The Review Team understood that the programme relates to subjects and not to modules and thus meets the national requirements.

Lectures in the full-time programme cover 834 academic hours, i.e. 17.6% of all the study time, lectures in the part-time programme cover 434 academic hours, i.e. 9% of all the study time. The Review Team notices that the number of contact hours through lectures delivered by full-time professors should be higher.

The programme in full-time studies is divided in 17,6% lectures, 21,6% practicals, 50,1% self studies, 10,9% consultations. This amounts to a total number of 4804 academic hours (180 credits), the contact hours amount to 2394, i.e. 49.9% of all the study time (see p. 13 and table 5 p. 14 SER). The part-time programme is divided into 9% lectures, 10,2% practicals, 67,9 %, self studies, 12,9% consultations. Total: 4804 academic hours (180 credits) including 1544 contact hours, i.e. 32,1% of the whole study time (see p. 13, 14 and table 5 p. 14 SER). The Review Team has serious doubts about the high quantity of self-studies and the realization of 10,9%/12,9%"consultations". The Review Team judges that an amendment of the programme's structure with the aim to offer more lectures might better ensure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. This opinion of the Team was supported during the interviews with the teaching staff and the students. However, the social partners expressed to the Team their satisfaction with students achievement of skills and knowledge. The students also were satisfied with the teaching process.

Part of the recommended courses literature was found to be out-of-date (e.g. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW, p. 127, 129 Annex2 SER; ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE LAW p. 136,137 Annex 2 SER; CRIMINAL LAW, p. 146, 147 Annex 2 SER; LABOUR LAW, p. 179, 189 Annex 2 SER; EUROPEAN UNION LAW, p. 227, 228 Annex2 SER; CRIMINALISTICS, p. 259, 260 Annex 2 SER). Consequently, it makes negative quite impact on the content of studies and the quality of the final theses. Therefore the College should advance the use of more up-to-date literature (domestic and foreign) in teaching, in research, and in the preparation of final theses.

The Review Team was shown some bachelor theses. Unfortunately, not all of them reflected the achievement of the intended learning outcomes, and showed the degree to which the students are supposed to be acquainted with the methods of legal research.

To some extent the importance of the European dimension in the field of law is taken into account. In order to avoid situation of focusing solely on the local context in the programme, this dimension should be further augmented and developed, and closely related to contemporary problems in the EU Law.

It also was found that including more law-related optional subjects in the curriculum would be beneficial for the programme students.

The Mode of Teaching: "Traditional" [e.g. p. 49, 55, 61, 75 (traditional, problem teaching) Annex 2 of SER] is not explained and seems to contradict to some Teaching Methods (e.g. p. 114, 167 Annex 2 SER). In some course descriptions, the classification: "Mode of Teaching" (e.g. Political Science, p. 49 Annex 2 of SER; Logic and Social Researches, p. 75 Annex 2 of SER) is to be found, and in other descriptions, the classification "Teaching Method" is used (e.g. General information International Law, p. 217 Annex 2 of SER; European Union Law, p. 223 Annex 2 of SER). The difference between the two did not become obvious. Therefore, it will be necessary to adjust the course description and to use consistent terminology.

Conclusion: The use of more up-to-date domestic and foreign literature in teaching, in research, and in the preparation of final theses is necessary. It is necessary to increase quality of final thesis. Finally, the Review Team believes that the curriculum design meets the minimum legal requirements, although some improvements are necessary. It is recommended to increase the number of lectures and to reduce the self-study activities. Taking into account the daily working hours in their jobs, the part-time students face problems to satisfy the curriculum requirements of self-study and consultations.

2.3. Teaching staff

The teaching staff corresponds to the legal requirements regarding their number, qualification and structure. However, the qualifications of the teaching staff are somewhat unbalanced from the point of view of the academic excellence. As a positive aspect, the teaching staff has improved since the last evaluation. New members joined in order to implement recommendations regarding the internationalization (some EU related legal subjects were added to the curriculum). There are permanent staff members with foreign degrees and internships in several EU and non-EU countries. The programme involves high ranking legal practitioners (judges, who are teaching in the programme) and the teaching staff participates in domestic and international academic activities (editorial boards, projects).

The teacher-student ratio of 6 students per one teacher of the programme is favourable.

However, there is a significant room for development both in academic and methodological context**.** The Review Team found out that students, as a rule, are not aware of textbooks and research contributions of their teachers. Creating a more interactive and inclusive study and research environment would be beneficial and should be encouraged.

The number of permanent staff is rather small, only 6 people are employed full-time while others are practicing lawyers employed elsewhere. There is a need for increasing the number of permanent staff members even though the current workload of the teaching staff is balanced and reasonable. The teaching staff is motivated and dedicated.

The practitioners teaching in the programme contribute practical knowledge from different institutions. The academic freedom does not seem to be endangered since the more pragmatic practitioners work side by side with permanent professors possessing critical scholarly vision. The fact that teaching positions at the College are competitive is a positive element.

The SER contain facts and figures indicating that the academic development of the teaching staff is encouraged by the College. During 2012-2017, there were 14 teachers having participated in the internships and 39 in the seminars and trainings. Professional internships took place in several foreign countries. There have been 19 conferences directly related to the programme. Also, 42 scientific articles and 24 presentations were delivered during the period under evaluation. However, the implementation of the academic career model in practice rather focused more on employing the staff and not so much on the regular evaluation of the academic performance and the development of the existing teaching staff during its contractual period. For example, it was mentioned during the meetings that there was no clear expectation of the department (of an individual member of the teaching staff) to publish scholarly articles, that would benefit the effectiveness of teaching process but rather the emphasis on the right and the opportunity to publish. At the same time, there is good evidence that academic activities such as participation at the conferences are supported. Also the funding by the European Social Fund (together with the Lithuanian government) shows that the staff members are capable to apply and carry out projects in applied sciences.

According to the teaching staff, research topics in applied science are identified by the teaching staff themselves and the research groups are self-formed. However, there is a lack of institutional planning, clear strategy, and transparent and sustainable funding. Although guidelines how to conduct research exist, yet the department activities related to research are not sufficiently communicated among the teaching staff. An elaboration of a clear and sustainable strategy to support the development of teaching staff is highly advisable.

Conclusion: The teaching staff meets the general legal criteria and the established requirements. Some improvements (regarding the number of full-time employed teaching staff, support of research and mobility, a strategy on individual academic career development etc.) are recommended.

2.4. Facilities and learning resources

According to the SER (Table 12) the Law Study programme of the college takes place at three different locations: at Maironio Str. 7 and 18, and at Aukštaičių Str. 9. In total it has 394 workplaces, of which 122 are computerized. Given the total number of students (28 full-time and 123 part-time students) this is more than sufficient despite the fact, that the same premises are

also used by the students of other disciplines taught at the Utena College and not just by the students of the programme under evaluation.

According to the information provided by the SER and corroborated during the site-visit, the technical equipment the students and teachers of the programme are using seems to be up-to-date and doesn't leave much to be desired in this area.

During their meeting with the Review Team students expressed their satisfaction with the arrangements, the amount, and the quality of students' practice. The practice has to be performed internships in various law enforcement and legal institutions, organisations or enterprises in Utena region and elsewhere in Lithuania. As reported in the SER students perform their practice of *Activity of law enforcement institutions* (cognitive practice) and the practice of *Developing Specialty Skills* in district courts, notary's offices, law firms, bailiff's offices, public prosecutor's offices, institutions of pre-trial investigation, and legal services of enterprises, organisations and municipalities. The place of the *Final practice* is selected in accordance with the specialization and tuned with the topic of the final thesis.

As the previous evaluation already pointed out, certain problem was observed regarding the library holdings. Despite the agreement with the Miškinių Public Library (which is a general library not having many law-related books) and despite the subscriptions to EBSCO Publishing, Emerald Management e-Journals Collection and Taylor & Francis databases making a number of e-journals available to the academic staff, the library does not seem to have sufficient resources for research work and cannot successfully help "to implement the aims of studies, science and continuous learning" of teachers and of students (SER p. 22). During the site visit the Review Team visited the Utena Public library (Utenos A. ir M. Miškinių viešoji biblioteka) and could see a part of the law-related literature and periodicals available there.

Although in the last two years the library has increased its holdings by 64 titles (of which 30 are in foreign language) this seems rather modest for an institution that has the ambition to perform the "adaptation of scientific and research results in the study process, execution of scientific research and experimental activity, announcement of their results, qualification update, etc." (SER p. 20).

The Review Team was shown a demonstration of the Moodle learning platform. It was impressed by the way the teachers are using it to assure the permanent accessibility of teaching materials and study related information to the students, as well as giving them the opportunity to communicate with them.

Conclusion: The facilities, the technical equipment, and learning resources meet the established criteria and legal requirements. However, the library holdings need serious

improvement. The number of up-to-date law related volumes and data bases needs to be increased in order to make possible the research work and the research based teaching.

2.5. Study process and students' performance assessment

The admission requirements are in accordance with the general national admission regulations. During the study period students are encouraged to take part in research, artistic and applied science activity, various projects, contests, and other events. There are 3 (In Corpore: Human Rights", "A Country that is Good to Live in", "Aspects of Sustainable Development: Theory and Practice") conferences held in Utena UAS, where students are encourage to take part in. The students seem to take part in conference only as listeners not as speakers.

It was found that academic international mobility of the students is quite scarce. This is maybe also due to the fact that the programme is focused mostly on the national law and only very few subjects on international or EU law were implemented. During the previous evaluation it was recommended to take serious efforts to motivate students to take part in mobility programmes. Despite the claimed efforts of the College to increase the number of students who participated in mobility programmes, the SER states that during the period 2015-2017 there were no students who used the opportunity to spend a semester in a foreign HEI. During the same period 2015-2017 6 students from Latvian HEI studied at Utena UAS. There is a list of foreign higher education institutions which have an agreement regarding mobility programmes with the College. It can be found at the following website (which was not easily accessible): (https://www.utenoskolegija.lt/upload/file_manager/VISUOMENEI/Bendradarbiavimas/Erasmus_partnerines_institucijos_2017.pdf). It was found that the list of foreign HEI partners is uploaded to the website section VISUOMENEI (For community), BENDRADARBIAVIMAS (Cooperation), although it might be expected to find this list in the sections under the headings STUDENTAMS (For students – ERASMUS+). All this makes the list hard to find. It would be reasonable to upload the list of partners to the section STUDENTAMS (For students – ERASMUS+), so that all information about the ERASMUS+ admission process be in one place and easily accessible. Currently the communication between those in charge of the programme and the students regarding the international mobility does not seem to be systematically organised.

The support for the students is in place. The students start their studies with a 16-hours course of the Introduction into Studies delivered by the head of the Department of Law, the library staff, and the Head of the Electronic Teaching Centre.

To evaluate the achievements a variety of methods are applied: examinations, course work assessment, evaluation of a project work, practical work evaluation, tests, colloquia,

defence of practice reports, etc. To evaluate the student achievements a cumulative score system is used. The composition of the cumulative score is calculated according to the proportions of the subject (module) description. Teachers inform their students about the assessment criteria at the beginning of the first class of the subject. The Review Team believes that by and large the assessment system can be regarded as adequate.

The Law programme is tailored to the local labour market needs. More than 60% of the graduates were already employed on the day of their graduation: in 2014 – 63%, in 2015 – 61.8% and in 2016– 69.2%. In general, students of the programme find job related with their speciality rather quickly. Most graduates work as bailiff assistants, court hearings secretaries, lawyers, police investigators, human resource managers. Some of them also work in private sector, although the Review Team was not given exact figures regarding the employment of graduates in private sector. During the site visit social partners mentioned that the graduates adapt quickly to the work environment. Nevertheless, despite a rather optimistic feedback from the labour market and stakeholders the Review Team found there is a significant student attrition varying from 13,3 % to 30% during the years 2011-2013. Therefore the students who successfully find a job do not represent the whole student body. The Review Team got no sufficient explanation regarding the reasons for the student drop-out rate.

The principles of academic honesty are regulated by the Academic Ethics Code (2016). Students of the College get acquainted with this document during their first lecture. To accomplish academic honesty at the College graduation theses are uploaded into the electronic plagiarism recognition system (since 2016).

The atmosphere in the Department of Law is rather informal and the relationship between students, teaching stuff, and administration seems to prefer informal solutions over formal and regulated procedures. Student complains and suggestions regarding the courses and teachers are usually made directly to teachers or administration in an informal way. However, the formal procedure of lodging appeals does exists. A student who disagrees with the examination procedure and (or) the exam (project work) assessment, can appeal to the Dean of the Faculty within two days from the announcement of the examination (project work) assessment. The appeal procedure (i.e. the lodging of the appeal, the appointment of the Appeal Committee, the investigation of appeals, and the decision-making) is regulated by Appeal Committee Regulations of The College. The Review Team found no appeals submitted during the period under evaluation. This raises some doubts about the efficiency of the system in practice. The informal approach preferred by the administration and students may lead to a non-equal treatment and preference to those who have a stronger social status (i.e. working students who are employed by influential employers).

Conclusion: The study process and student performance assessment meet the legal requirements. However, the Review Team encourage using formal procedure of lodging appeals and complaints. The use of mobility programmes need to be intensified again, and the access to the information on mobility should be improved. The motivation system for students to take part in mobility programmes should be reconsidered.

2.6. Programme management

It was established that responsibilities for decisions and monitoring of the implementation of the programme are clearly allocated. The management of the programme takes place at several levels: the Department or Low, the faculty, the College administration, the self-government institutions of the College. Decision-making regarding the implementation of the programme, quality assurance, improvement and other important issues is performed in a collegial manner in the meetings of the department of Law, the Study Programme Committee, the Dean's Office, the Rector's Office, the Faculty Board, or the Academic Board. Decisions are documented by the minutes of the meetings and by the orders of the Rector and the Dean. The responsibility of the implementers of the study programme is defined by the internal legal documents of the College. The main coordinator of the implementation of the programme is the Head of the Department of Law. He is organising all important activities of the department, submits a draft plan to the Dean regarding the allocation of pedagogical load of the department teachers, takes care of the informational material and technical realisation of the study programme etc. The Head of the Department also makes sure that the programme is continuously updated, that it corresponds to the needs of the labour market, and reflects the latest research in the field. The Head of the Department organises meetings of the teachers in the department to discuss relevant study-related issues, discuss and approve tasks for examinations, topics for course papers and final theses, discuss student achievement and academic progress, provide suggestions regarding the quality of studies and the improvement of the organisation of study etc.

The College states that the Quality Guide of the College describes in detail the Study Quality Management System that is based on ISO 9001 Quality Management Standard.

Although the stakeholders told the Review Team that they were informed about the internal quality assurance measures, it was found that no written procedure was approved by the authorised bodies of the College regarding the information to be collected from the stakeholders. The aim and frequency of surveys, the scope of information, forms of questionnaires, process analyses, feedback process, and the influence on certain decisions remained unclear.

The outcomes of the previous internal and external evaluations of the programme are used for the improvement of the programme. Still it was unclear to the Review Team how many decisions were taken during the period after the last external evaluation by the main authorities (i. e. the SPC, the Dean's Office, the Rector's Office, the Faculty Board, the Academic Board) regarding the proposals to amend the study programme and to what extent the legal regulation of the programme management is realised in practice.

The representatives of the College explained to the Review Team that their main sources of information about the quality of studies are the surveys of students, teachers, and employers, as well as publicly available findings of the national research and surveys. The information regarding the student achievements is systematically collected, analysed and evaluated. However, the Review Team have reservations regarding the extent and efficiency of the information gathering system:

1. what is the practical importance of surveys; which minutes contain proposals based on surveys and survey results, how many proposals have been received regarding amendments of the study programme etc.;

2. how they were disseminated to ensure a proper involvement of the stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement processes;

3. how the feedback was given to social partners regarding each particular case of the proposal to amend the study programme.

The Review Team was acquainted with certain types of questionnaires used during surveys and judges that these questionnaires hardly allow statistical analysis of the information provided by the respondents.

The College states that it follows the principle of accountability to the society. Therefore, the main outcomes of internal and external evaluation of the programme are made public on the internet site of the College. The Review Team finds that the College publishes a lot of internal legal acts related to the study process on their internet site. Therefore it may be assumed that the College follows the principle of transparency. Though better compliance with the Par. 2 of Art. 47 of *Law on Higher Education and Research of Republic of Lithuania* could be arranged by providing more open information related to analysis of the programme's quality and improvement, e.g. opinions of social partners, students, graduates and other interested parties, etc.

Analysis of the recommendations of the previous (2014) external evaluation with regard to programme management (students should take a greater role in the study programme management) shows that this recommendation could be considered as fulfilled _de jure_: one student and one graduate are members of the Study Programme Committee. Furthermore,

student representative and representatives of academic groups are invited to attend the meetings of the Department when relevant issues related to the programme improvement are discussed. Student representative participates during the teacher accreditation as a member of the Teacher Accreditation Board of the Faculty.

It is still unclear, however, to what extent the stakeholders of the programme take part in the different committees and how their proposals are treated there. The Review Team could not find out how many proposals were made by the stakeholders and how many decisions were taken according to their proposals (if there were any), and how (if) the feedback was given to the stakeholders.

The Review Team judges that the following deficiencies of the programme management still remain:

1. although information on the implementation of the programme is collected, it is doubtful whereas it is analysed sufficiently afterwards (the Review Team was not acquainted with the proposals/opinions of stakeholders and responses of the College regarding them);
2. the evaluation and improvement processes does not sufficiently involve stakeholders;
3. the internal quality assurance measures related to cooperation with stakeholders are not sufficient enough.

Conclusion: The programme management meets the established minimal requirements. Attention is needed to some discrepancy between the legal provisions and the way they are put into practice.

III. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The European and international dimensions should be better present in the curriculum and in teaching. Study materials should be adapted to the reality which includes the EU membership and the globalisation which affects the future profile of the legal profession.

2. The curriculum should offer more lectures and reduce the extent of self-study activities. The mode of teaching has to be expressed with a consistent terminology in the course descriptions.

3. The use of more up-to-date literature in teaching should be advanced, the process of the final theses preparation included.

4. Students should be encouraged to use more up-to-date legal literature (also foreign) in their final theses.

5. It is advised to increase the number of teaching staff to allow more enriched study atmosphere and balance the influence of scholars and their views on the students.

6. There is a need of a clear and sustainable strategy defining the support of individual academic careers and the professional development of the teaching staff.

7. The College should endeavour to increase the number of the full-time teaching staff of law because the present number of permanent staff is not sufficient enough for a research-based teaching.

8. It would be beneficial to introduce a system of constant evaluation of teaching staff (both by means of student surveys and of research performance) during the period of their contract.

9. It is recommended to establish at the level of the Law Department the financial management of the research activity the law department is performing

10. In order to promote the research activity and the self-study in the field of law the College should increase the number of law-related books (domestic and foreign) in the library and the number of legal databases available to both students and the teaching staff. The College should consider a strategy of fund-raising that would facilitate a sustainable development of the law library and of the research activity in the field of law.

11. The College should consider the possibility of introducing a system of motivation of mobility and research activity for the permanent staff teaching law (e. g. regular leaves in the sense of a sabbatical semester etc.) and for students. Although students are primarily focused on domestic law a more systematic participation in exchange programmes would broaden the horizon of students and increase their employability.

12. It is necessary to put into practice the role the stakeholders are supposed to play in the decision-making process related to the programme management.

13. The stakeholders and the public should be better informed on activity improving the programme. All parties taking part in the decision-making process should receive feedback.

14. Formal procedures for student appeals and complains should prevail over the informal communication to guarantee equal treatment of students.

15. The communication and organisation related to the HEI organised conferences should be more thoughtful to allow students to present their views and be active participants during the discussions.

16. The international mobility opportunities should be better communicated to the student body.

17. The problems related to student attrition should be better handled, there is a need for accurate analysis and clear strategy to avoid dropouts.

IV. SUMMARY

The aim of the programme fulfils the requirements of the education and research policies. It is possible to expect that the graduates will be proficient in critical thinking and knowledgeable in the methods of applying legislative acts. The programme trains qualified lawyers being able to work independently in legal professions. The information for prospective students and is continuously disseminated and updated by the management, e.g. at regional congresses, in various schools and through the website of the College. The learning outcomes are clearly formulated, well-defined, transparent, and accessible.

The curriculum design of programme is convincing, because it starts with basic knowledge and enables students to deal gradually with more special law contents and their application. The system of assessment (examinations) is clear, and the students are acquainted with it at the beginning of their studies. Subjects and topics are not repeated. However, the College should advance the use of more up-to-date literature (domestic and foreign) in teaching, in research, and in the preparation of final theses, which it lacks at present. Including more law-related optional subjects in the curriculum would be beneficial.

The teaching staff seems to be motivated and dedicated. However, it is necessary to establish a clear and sustainable strategy to support its development, strengthen its research work and mobility. Also, there is a need for increasing the number of permanent staff members even though the current workload of the teaching staff seems to be balanced and reasonable.

The teaching staff should endeavour to do more in the field of research. This is a precondition for a research based teaching.

The premises of the College are adequate both in size and in quality. The technical equipment the students and teachers of the programme are using is up-to-date. The teachers of the programme are making good use of the Moodle learning platform.

The library holdings of law related literature and data bases are modest and are not quite enough for research work expected at this kind of academic institution. The College should obtain more up-to-date national and international legal literature.

The system of student assessment is clear and students are informed about it at the beginning of their studies. Students have the possibility to lodge formal complains regarding the study process and the assessment of their performance, however they usually do it in an informal way. Students get academic support. Documents containing the regulations of the study process are publicly accessible and appropriate. Students and teachers have opportunities to take part in research activities although very few make use of them. The use of international mobility programmes is very modest; this issue should be addressed by the College.

There is Study programme committee, which decides on programme changes using the input from various sources. The programme management is an on-going process at the College. It involves teaching staff and students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders. Yet the real involvement of stakeholders in the programme management is not always well documented in the College records. This casts some doubt on the real level of participation of the stakeholders in the programme management process. Consequently, the improvement of this participation is highly recommended.

V. GENERAL ASSESSMENT

The study programme *Law* (state code – 6531KX007) at Utena College is given **positive** evaluation.

Study programme assessment in points by evaluation areas.

No.	Evaluation Area	Evaluation of an area in points*
1.	Programme aims and learning outcomes	3
2.	Curriculum design	2
3.	Teaching staff	2
4.	Facilities and learning resources	2
5.	Study process and students' performance assessment	2
6.	Programme management	2
	Total:	**13**

*1 (unsatisfactory) - there are essential shortcomings that must be eliminated;
2 (satisfactory) - meets the established minimum requirements, needs improvement;
3 (good) - the field develops systematically, has distinctive features;
4 (very good) - the field is exceptionally good.

Grupės vadovas:
Team leader: **Prof. dr. Janez Kranjc**

Grupės nariai:
Team members: **Prof. dr. Vera de Hesselle**

Prof. dr. Tanel Kerikmäe

Ms. Jolita Mikalkevičiūtė

Ms. Žiedūnė Sabaitytė

UTENOS KOLEGIJOS PIRMOSIOS PAKOPOS STUDIJŲ PROGRAMOS *TEISĖ* (VALSTYBINIS KODAS 6531KX007) 2018-02-08 EKSPERTINIO VERTINIMO IŠVADŲ NR. SV4-15 IŠRAŠAS

<...>

V. APIBENDRINAMASIS ĮVERTINIMAS

Utenos kolegijos studijų programa *Teisė* (valstybinis kodas 6531KX007) vertinama **teigiamai**.

Eil. Nr.	Vertinimo sritis	Srities įvertinimas, balais*
1.	Programos tikslai ir numatomi studijų rezultatai	3
2.	Programos sandara	2
3.	Personalas	2
4.	Materialieji ištekliai	2
5.	Studijų eiga ir jos vertinimas	2
6.	Programos vadyba	2
	Iš viso:	13

* 1 - Nepatenkinamai (yra esminių trūkumų, kuriuos būtina pašalinti)
2 - Patenkinamai (tenkina minimalius reikalavimus, reikia tobulinti)
3 - Gerai (sistemiškai plėtojama sritis, turi savitų bruožų)
4 - Labai gerai (sritis yra išskirtinė)

<...>

IV. SANTRAUKA

Studijų programos tikslas tenkina švietimo ir mokslo politikos reikalavimus. Galima tikėtis, kad absolventai gebės kritiškai mąstyti ir mokės taikyti teisės aktus. Studijų programa rengia kvalifikuotus teisininkus, gebančius savarankiškai verstis teisės profesine veikla. Kolegijos vadovybė nuolat skelbia ir atnaujina informaciją būsimiems studentams, pvz., regiono kongresuose, įvairiose mokyklose ir kolegijos interneto svetainėje. Studijų rezultatai yra aiškiai suformuluoti, gerai apibrėžti, suprantami ir prieinami.

Programos sandara įtikinama, nes pradedama nuo pagrindinių žinių ir pamažu studentai supažindinami su labiau specializuotu teisės turiniu ir jo taikymu. Vertinimo (egzaminų) sistema yra aiški; studentai su ja supažindinami studijų pradžioje. Dalykai ir temos nesikartoja. Vis dėlto kolegija turėtų skatinti naudoti naujesnę literatūrą (nacionalinę ir užsienio) tiek dėstant, tiek vykdant tyrimus, tiek rašant baigiamuosius darbus, nes šiuo metu to trūksta. Būtų naudinga į studijų turinį įtraukti daugiau su teise susijusių pasirenkamųjų dalykų.

Dėstytojai atrodo motyvuoti ir atsidavę. Tačiau būtina įtvirtinti aiškią ir tvarią strategiją, kaip paremti dėstytojų tobulinimąsi, sustiprinti tiriamąją veiklą ir judumą. Taip pat reikia didinti nuolatinių dėstytojų skaičių, nors dabartinis dėstytojų darbo krūvis atrodo subalansuotas ir tinkamas.

Dėstytojai turėtų stengtis daugiau siekti tyrimų srityje. Tai yra būtina tyrimais grindžiamo dėstymo sąlyga.

Kolegijos patalpos yra tinkamo dydžio ir kokybės. Studijų programos studentų ir dėstytojų naudojama techninė įranga yra šiuolaikiška. Studijų programos dėstytojai puikiai naudojasi mokymosi platforma „Moodle".

Bibliotekos teisinės literatūros ir duomenų bazių fondai yra kuklūs ir jų nevisiškai pakanka tiriamajam darbui, kokio tikimasi iš tokios akademinės institucijos. Kolegija turėtų įsigyti naujesnės nacionalinės ir tarptautinės teisės literatūros.

Studentų vertinimo sistema yra aiški; studentai su ja supažindinami studijų pradžioje. Studentai turi galimybę teikti oficialius skundus dėl studijų eigos ir jų pasiekimų vertinimo, tačiau paprastai jie tai daro neoficialiai. Studentai gauna akademinę paramą. Dokumentai, kuriuose reglamentuota studijų eiga, yra viešai prieinami ir tinkami. Studentai ir dėstytojai turi galimybių dalyvauti tiriamojoje veikloje, tačiau tik nedidelė jų dalis jomis pasinaudoja. Dalyvavimas tarptautinėse judumo programose labai kuklus; šį klausimą kolegija turėtų spręsti.

Kolegijoje veikia Studijų programos komitetas, kuris priima sprendimus dėl studijų programos pokyčių, atsižvelgdamas į įvairių šaltinių pateiktą nuomonę. Programos vadyba yra tęstinis kolegijoje vykdomas procesas. Jis apima dėstytojus ir studentus, absolventus, darbdavius ir kitus socialinius dalininkus. Tačiau realus socialinių dalininkų dalyvavimas programos vadyboje ne visada tinkamai atsispindi kolegijos dokumentuose. Todėl kyla abejonių dėl realaus socialinių dalininkų dalyvavimo programos vadybos procese. Taigi, primygtinai rekomenduojama gerinti šį aspektą.

<…>

III. REKOMENDACIJOS

1. Studijų turinys ir dėstymas turėtų geriau atspindėti europinę ir tarptautinę dimensijas. Studijų medžiaga turėtų būti pritaikyta, atsižvelgiant į realybę, t. y. ES narystę ir globalizaciją, kurios daro įtaką būsimam teisės profesijos profiliui.
2. Studijų programoje turėtų būti daugiau paskaitų ir mažesnė savarankiško darbo apimtis. Dalykų aprašuose dėstymo būdas turėtų būti nurodytas naudojant nuoseklią terminiją.
3. Reikėtų skatinti naudotis naujesne literatūra dėstant bei rašant baigiamuosius darbus.
4. Studentai turėtų būti raginami savo baigiamuosiuose darbuose remtis naujausia teisės literatūra (įskaitant užsienio literatūrą).
5. Rekomenduojama didinti dėstytojų skaičių siekiant praturtinti studijų atmosferą ir subalansuoti akademikų bei jų požiūrių įtaką studentams.
6. Reikalinga aiški ir tvari strategija, kurioje būtų apibrėžta parama dėstytojų individualiai akademinei karjerai ir profesiniam tobulėjimui.
7. Kolegija turėtų stengtis didinti visu etatu dirbančių teisės dėstytojų skaičių, nes dabartinis nuolatinių dėstytojų skaičius nepakankamas siekiant užtikrinti tyrimais grindžiamą mokymą.
8. Būtų naudinga įdiegti nuolatinio dėstytojų vertinimo sistemą (tiek apklausiant studentus, tiek vertinant tiriamosios veiklos rezultatus) darbo sutarties su jais laikotarpiu.
9. Rekomenduojama Teisės katedros lygiu įtvirtinti šios katedros vykdomos tiriamosios veiklos finansų valdymą.
10. Siekdama skatinti tiriamąją veiklą ir savarankiškas studijas teisės srityje, kolegija turėtų padidinti su teise susijusių knygų (nacionalinių ir užsienio) skaičių bibliotekoje ir studentams bei dėstytojams prieinamų teisės duomenų bazių skaičių. Kolegija turėtų apsvarstyti lėšų pritraukimo strategiją, kuri prisidėtų prie tvarios teisės bibliotekos ir teisės srities tyrimų plėtros.
11. Kolegija turėtų apsvarstyti galimybę įdiegti judumo ir tiriamosios veiklos motyvacijos sistemą nuolatiniams teisės dėstytojams (pvz., reguliarias moksliniam darbui skirtas semestro trukmės atostogas ir pan.) ir studentams. Nors studentai didžiausią dėmesį skiria

šalies teisės sistemai, sistemingesnis dalyvavimas mainų programose praplėstų studentų akiratį ir padidintų jų galimybes įsidarbinti.

12. Reikia praktiškai įgyvendinti socialinių dalininkų vaidmenį sprendimų priėmimo procese, susijusiame su studijų programos vadyba.

13. Socialiniai dalininkai ir visuomenė turėtų būti geriau informuoti apie studijų programos tobulinimo veiksmus. Visos šalys, dalyvaujančios priimant sprendimus, turėtų gauti grįžtamąjį ryšį.

14. Oficiali studentų apeliacijų ir skundų tvarka turėtų tapti viršesne už neformalų bendravimą, siekiant užtikrinti vienodą požiūrį į studentus.

15. Su aukštosios mokyklos rengiamomis konferencijomis susijusi komunikacija ir organizacija turėtų būti labiau apgalvotos, kad studentai galėtų išreikšti savo nuomonę ir aktyviai dalyvauti diskusijose.

16. Tarptautinio judumo galimybės turėtų būti geriau komunikuojamos studentams.

17. Problemos, susijusios su studentų skaičiaus mažėjimu, turėtų būti geriau sprendžiamos; siekiant išvengti studentų nubyrėjimo, būtina tiksli analizė ir aiški strategija.

<…>

_____

Paslaugos teikėjas patvirtina, jog yra susipažinęs su Lietuvos Respublikos baudžiamojo kodekso 235 straipsnio, numatančio atsakomybę už melagingą ar žinomai neteisingai atliktą vertimą, reikalavimais.

Vertėjos rekvizitai (vardas, pavardė, parašas)